Chapter 313 Property Value Limitation Financial Impact of the Proposed Luminant Generation Company, LLC Project in the Colorado Independent School District (Project # 1042)

Prepared by

MOAK, CASEY & ASSOCIATES

TEXAS SCHOOL FINANCE EXPERTS

March 31, 2015

Executive Summary

Luminant Generation Company, LLC (Company) has requested that the Colorado Independent School District (CISD) consider granting a property value limitation under Chapter 313 of the Tax Code, also known as the Texas Economic Development Act. In an application submitted to CISD on November 19, 2014 the Company plans to invest $301.7 million to construct a renewable solar energy electric generation facility. Moak, Casey & Associates (MCA) has been retained to prepare an analysis of this value limitaiton and help the district navigate the overall application and agreement process.

The Luminant project (Project # 1042) is consistent with the state's goal to "encourage large scale capital investments in this state." When enacted as House Bill 1200 in 2001, Chapter 313 of the Tax Code granted eligibility to companies engaged in manufacturing, research and development, and renewable electric energy production to apply to school districts for property value limitations. Subsequent legislative changes expanded eligibility to clean coal projects, nuclear power generation and data centers, among others.

Under the provisions of Chapter 313, CISD may offer a minimum value limitation of $20 million. This value limitation, under the proposed application, will begin in the 2017-18 school year and remain at that level of taxable value for Maintenance and Operations (M&O) tax purposes for ten years. The entire project value will remain taxable for I&S or debt service purposes for the term of the agreement.

MCA's initial school finance analysis is detailed in this report. The overall conclusions are as follows, but please read all of the subsequent details in the report below for more information.

Total Revenue Loss Payment owed to CISD	$3,554,062
Total Savings to Company after Revenue Loss Payment. (This does not include any supplemental benefit payments to the district.)	$16,043,617

Application Process

After the school district has submitted an application to the Comptroller's Office (Comptroller), the Comptroller begins reviewing the application for completeness. The purpose of this review is to ensure all necessary information and attachments are included in the application before moving forward with the formal review process. At the time the application is determined complete—typically 4-6 weeks after receipt—the Comptroller will deliver a Completeness Letter to the company and the school district. The Comptroller's Office issued its Completeness Letter for the Luminant Generation Company project on January 16, 2015.

The issuance of a Completeness Letter is important because it sets the timeline for the rest of process. From the date of issuance, the Comptroller has 90 days to conduct its full review of

the project and provide its certificate for a limitation on appraised value. After the certificate is received, the district has until the 150th day from the receipt of the Completeness Letter or until December 31st, whichever is earlier, to adopt an agreement.

Each value limitation agreement is unique and to ensure the proper revenue-loss protection and maximum supplemental benefits are in place, an understanding of the school district's finances and a thorough knowledge of the Chapter 313 statute are required. MCA and O'Hanlon, McCollom & Demerath will ensure the best interests of CISD are secured. After the Comptroller's certificate is received, O'Hanlon, McCollom & Demerath will contact the school district to discuss the value limitation agreement and begin negotiations of the supplemental benefit payment with the Company. A final version of the agreement must be submitted to the Comptroller for review 30 days prior to final adoption by the school district's board of trustees.

At the final board meeting, the school board will review the Value Limitation Agreement and Findings of Fact that detail the project's conformance with state law. In some instances, the school board may also be required to adopt a job waiver or create a reinvestment zone during this meeting. Prior to this meeting, O'Hanlon, McCollom & Demerath will provide the District with the necessary agenda language and any additional action items.

How the 313 Agreement Interacts with Texas School Finance

M&O funding for Texas schools relies on two methods of finance: local school district property taxes and state aid. State aid consists of three components: Tier I, Tier II and additional state aid for tax reduction.

Tier I provides state funding based on ADA and special student populations, as well as transportation. The local funds for Tier I are M&O taxes raised at the compressed tax rate—$1.00 per $100 of taxable value for most school districts (less any recapture payments owed to the state from high property-wealth school districts).

Tier II guarantees a specific amount of funding per student in weighted average daily attendance for each penny of a school district's tax effort above a specified level. There are two levels of Tier II funding—funding under the six so-called golden pennies and the eleven so-called copper pennies. Voter approval is required in most cases to access the last two golden pennies and the eleven copper pennies.

Additional State Aid for Tax Reduction (ASATR) guarantees a school district a set amount of state and local M&O funds per student in weighted average daily attendance to compensate for the mandatory reduction in, or compression of, the local M&O tax rate that was adopted in 2005 or 2006. For more detailed information on the school finance funding system, please review the Texas Education Agency's School Finance 101: Funding of Texas Public Schools. For the 2014-15 school year it is estimated that 230 school districts will receive ASATR hold-harmless funding ($335 million in state funding). ASATR funding is expected to be eliminated by the 2017-18 school year under current law. CISD is not currently receiving ASATR funds and this source is not a factor in the calculations presented below.

For a school district that approves a Chapter 313 value limitation, the first year is often problematic financially. The implementation of the value limitation often results in an M&O

revenue loss to the school district in the first year of the limitation that would not be reimbursed by the state, but require some type of compensation from the Company under the revenue protection provisions of the agreement. This is because the general school finance formula system calculates state aid entitlements using the property value for the preceding year as certified by the Comptroller.

In most instances smaller revenue losses would be anticipated in years 2-10 of the limitation when the state M&O property values are aligned at the minimum value established by the Board on both the local tax roll and the corresponding state property value study. **If the full value of the project increases significantly during the value limitation period, the revenue losses may be greater than originally estimated.**

A taxpayer receiving a value limitation pays M&O taxes on the reduced value for the project in years 1-10 and receives a tax bill for I&S taxes based on the full project value throughout the qualifying and value limitation period (and thereafter).

Future legislative action on school funding could potentially affect the impact of the value limitation on the school district's finances and result in revenue-loss estimates that differ from the estimates presented in this report.

Underlying School District Data Assumptions

A key element in any analysis of the school finance implications of a Chapter 313 agreement is the provision for revenue protection in the agreement between the school district and the applicant. The agreement calls for a calculation of the revenue impact of the value limitation in years 1-10 of the agreement, under whatever school finance and property tax laws are in effect in each of those years. This meets the statutory requirement under Section 313.027(f)(1) of the Tax Code to provide school district revenue-protection language in the agreement. This approach also reduces guess work as to future changes in school finance and property tax laws.

Student enrollment counts are held constant at 1,022 students in average daily attendance (ADA) in analyzing the effects of the project on the finances of CISD. The District's local tax base reached an estimated $440.5 million for the 2014 tax year (the most recent year available) and is maintained at that level for the forecast period in order to isolate the effects of the property value limitation. An M&O tax rate of $1.17 per $100 is used throughout this analysis. CISD has estimated 2013-14 state property wealth per weighted ADA or WADA of approximately $246,129, which is below the state average. As a result, CISD is not considered a Chapter 41 or recapture district under the school finance system. Table 1 summarizes the enrollment and property value assumptions for the 15 years that are the subject of this analysis.

The M&O tax rate for the 2027-28 school year may reflect the impact of the Chapter 313 project value returning to the total tax roll for M&O funding purposes, which could result in a lower M&O tax rate. For the purposes of these estimates, it is assumed that the current M&O tax rate in year 11 of the limitation $1.075 per $100 and then return to the $1.17 per

$100 M&O tax rate. The lower M&O rate is reflected for that year in the limitation model shown below.

The general approach used here to analyze the future revenue stream of the school district under a value limitation is to maintain static enrollment and property values in order to isolate the effects of the value limitation under the school finance system. ASATR is continued under the current funding elements until the 2017-18 school year although, as noted previously, ASATR funds are not reflected in the calculations below in any year.

Table 1 – Base District Information with Luminant Project Value and Limitation Values

Year of Agreement	School Year	ADA	WADA	M&O Tax Rate	I&S Tax Rate	CAD Value with Project	CAD Value with Limitation	CPTD with Project	CPTD With Limitation	CPTD Value with Project per WADA	CPTD Value with Limitation per WADA
QTP0	2015-16	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$442,141,203	$442,141,203	$430,351,456	$430,351,456	$252,653	$252,653
QTP1	2016-17	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$479,658,083	$479,658,083	$432,039,466	$432,039,466	$253,644	$253,644
QTP2/VL1	2017-18	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$742,175,132	$460,453,193	$469,556,346	$469,556,346	$275,670	$275,670
VL2	2018-19	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$718,192,351	$460,453,193	$732,073,395	$450,351,456	$429,790	$264,395
VL3	2019-20	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$694,209,743	$460,453,193	$708,090,614	$450,351,456	$415,710	$264,395
VL4	2020-21	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$670,227,308	$460,453,193	$684,108,006	$450,351,456	$401,630	$264,395
VL5	2021-22	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$643,245,050	$460,453,193	$660,125,571	$450,351,456	$387,550	$264,395
VL6	2022-23	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$616,262,968	$460,453,193	$633,143,313	$450,351,456	$371,710	$264,395
VL7	2023-24	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$589,281,066	$460,453,193	$606,161,231	$450,351,456	$355,869	$264,395
VL8	2024-25	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$559,299,346	$460,453,193	$579,179,329	$450,351,456	$340,028	$264,395
VL9	2025-26	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$532,317,806	$460,453,193	$549,197,609	$450,351,456	$322,426	$264,395
VL10	2026-27	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$514,336,452	$460,453,193	$522,216,069	$450,351,456	$306,586	$264,395
VP1	2027-28	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.0750	$0.4380	$505,355,285	$505,355,285	$504,234,715	$450,351,456	$296,029	$264,395
VP2	2028-29	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$502,374,306	$502,374,306	$495,253,548	$495,253,548	$290,756	$290,756
VP3	2029-30	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$502,393,517	$502,393,517	$492,272,569	$492,272,569	$289,006	$289,006
VP4	2030-31	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$502,412,920	$502,412,920	$492,291,780	$492,291,780	$289,018	$289,018
VP5	2031-32	1,022.00	1,703.33	$1.1700	$0.4380	$502,432,517	$502,432,517	$492,311,183	$492,311,183	$289,029	$289,029

***Basic Allotment: $5,040; AISD Yield: $61.86; Equalized Wealth: $504,000 per WADA**

QT=	Qualifying Time Period
VL=	Value Limitation
VP=	Viable Presence

M&O Impact of the Luminant project on CISD

School finance models were prepared for CISD under these assumptions through the 2031-32 school year. Under the proposed agreement, a model is established to make a calculation of the "Baseline Revenue Model" by adding the total value of the project to the model, but without assuming that a value limitation is approved. These results are detailed in Table 2.

Additionally, a separate model is established to make a calculation of the "Value Limitation Revenue Model" by adding the project's limited value of $20 million to the model. These results are shown in Table 3.

Table 4 displays the results of the comparison between the Baseline Revenue Model and the Value Limitation Revenue Model (Tables 2 and 3). The difference between the two models indicates there will be a total revenue loss of $3.55 million in the initial limitation year under the Agreement.

Table 2– "Baseline Revenue Model"--Project Value Added with No Value Limitation

Year of Agreement	School Year	M&O Taxes @ Compressed Rate	State Aid	Additional State Aid-Hold Harmless	Recapture Costs	Additional Local M&O Collections	State Aid From Additional M&O Tax Collections	Recapture from the Additional Local Tax Effort	Other State Aid	Total General Fund
QTP0	2015-16	$4,353,646	$4,618,414	$0	$0	$740,120	$505,088	$0	$37,625	$10,254,893
QTP1	2016-17	$4,721,312	$4,601,534	$0	$0	$802,623	$542,628	$0	$37,625	$10,705,722
QTP2/VL1	2017-18	$7,350,323	$4,226,366	$0	$0	$1,249,555	$675,408	$0	$37,625	$13,539,277
VL2	2018-19	$7,110,495	$1,601,195	$0	$0	$1,208,784	$187,496	-$190,676	$37,625	$9,954,919
VL3	2019-20	$6,870,669	$1,841,023	$0	$0	$1,168,014	$201,132	-$166,167	$37,625	$9,952,295
VL4	2020-21	$6,630,845	$2,080,849	$0	$0	$1,127,244	$215,090	-$141,697	$37,625	$9,949,955
VL5	2021-22	$6,361,022	$2,320,673	$0	$0	$1,081,373	$227,473	-$116,720	$37,625	$9,911,446
VL6	2022-23	$6,091,201	$2,590,496	$0	$0	$1,035,504	$242,649	-$89,406	$37,625	$9,908,069
VL7	2023-24	$5,821,382	$2,860,317	$0	$0	$989,635	$257,770	-$62,170	$37,625	$9,904,559
VL8	2024-25	$5,521,565	$3,130,136	$0	$0	$938,666	$271,413	-$34,835	$37,625	$9,864,570
VL9	2025-26	$5,251,750	$3,429,953	$0	$0	$892,797	$289,573	-$4,981	$37,625	$9,896,717
VL10	2026-27	$5,071,936	$3,699,768	$0	$0	$862,229	$333,336	$0	$37,625	$10,004,894
VP1	2027-28	$4,987,842	$3,879,582	$0	$0	$374,089	$332,287	$0	$37,625	$9,611,425
VP2	2028-29	$4,943,931	$3,969,394	$0	$0	$840,468	$388,255	$0	$37,625	$10,179,673
VP3	2029-30	$4,944,119	$3,999,203	$0	$0	$840,500	$395,923	$0	$37,625	$10,217,370
VP4	2030-31	$4,944,309	$3,999,011	$0	$0	$840,533	$395,890	$0	$37,625	$10,217,368
VP5	2031-32	$4,944,501	$3,998,817	$0	$0	$840,565	$395,856	$0	$37,625	$10,217,364

QT= Qualifying Time Period
VL= Value Limitation
VP= Viable Presence

Table 3– "Value Limitation Revenue Model"--Project Value Added with Value Limit

Year of Agreement	School Year	M&O Taxes @ Compressed Rate	State Aid	Additional State Aid-Hold Harmless	Recapture Costs	Additional Local M&O Collections	State Aid From Additional M&O Tax Collections	Recapture from the Additional Local Tax Effort	Other State Aid	Total General Fund
QTP0	2015-16	$4,353,646	$4,618,414	$0	$0	$740,120	$505,088	$0	$37,625	$10,254,893
QTP1	2016-17	$4,721,312	$4,601,534	$0	$0	$802,623	$542,628	$0	$37,625	$10,705,722
QTP2/VL1	2017-18	$4,533,104	$4,226,366	$0	$0	$770,627	$417,493	$0	$37,625	$9,985,215
VL2	2018-19	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL3	2019-20	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL4	2020-21	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL5	2021-22	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL6	2022-23	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL7	2023-24	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL8	2024-25	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL9	2025-26	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VL10	2026-27	$4,533,104	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$770,627	$468,315	$0	$37,625	$10,228,085
VP1	2027-28	$4,987,842	$4,418,414	$0	$0	$374,089	$416,793	$0	$37,625	$10,234,763
VP2	2028-29	$4,943,931	$3,969,394	$0	$0	$840,468	$388,255	$0	$37,625	$10,179,673
VP3	2029-30	$4,944,119	$3,999,203	$0	$0	$840,500	$395,923	$0	$37,625	$10,217,370
VP4	2030-31	$4,944,309	$3,999,011	$0	$0	$840,533	$395,890	$0	$37,625	$10,217,368
VP5	2031-32	$4,944,501	$3,998,817	$0	$0	$840,565	$395,856	$0	$37,625	$10,217,364

QT= Qualifying Time Period
VL= Value Limitation
VP= Viable Presence

Table 4 – Value Limit less Project Value with No Limit

Year of Agreement	School Year	M&O Taxes @ Compressed Rate	State Aid	Additional State Aid-Hold Harmless	Recapture Costs	Additional Local M&O Collections	State Aid From Additional M&O Tax Collections	Recapture from the Additional Local Tax Effort	Other State Aid	Total General Fund
QTP0	2015-16	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0
QTP1	2016-17	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0
QTP2/VL1	2017-18	-$2,817,219	$0	$0	$0	-$478,928	-$257,915	$0	$0	-$3,554,062
VL2	2018-19	-$2,577,391	$2,817,219	$0	$0	-$438,157	$280,819	$190,676	$0	$273,166
VL3	2019-20	-$2,337,565	$2,577,391	$0	$0	-$397,387	$267,183	$166,167	$0	$275,789
VL4	2020-21	-$2,097,741	$2,337,565	$0	$0	-$356,617	$253,225	$141,697	$0	$278,129
VL5	2021-22	-$1,827,918	$2,097,741	$0	$0	-$310,746	$240,842	$116,720	$0	$316,639
VL6	2022-23	-$1,558,097	$1,827,918	$0	$0	-$264,877	$225,666	$89,406	$0	$320,016
VL7	2023-24	-$1,288,278	$1,558,097	$0	$0	-$219,008	$210,545	$62,170	$0	$323,526
VL8	2024-25	-$988,461	$1,288,278	$0	$0	-$168,039	$196,902	$34,835	$0	$363,515
VL9	2025-26	-$718,646	$988,461	$0	$0	-$122,170	$178,742	$4,981	$0	$331,368
VL10	2026-27	-$538,832	$718,646	$0	$0	-$91,602	$134,979	$0	$0	$223,191
VP1	2027-28	$0	$538,832	$0	$0	$0	$84,506	$0	$0	$623,338
VP2	2028-29	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0
VP3	2029-30	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0
VP4	2030-31	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0
VP5	2031-32	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0	$0

QT=	Qualifying Time Period
VL=	Value Limitation
VP=	Viable Presence

M&O Impact on the Taxpayer

Table 5 summarizes the impact of the property value limitation in terms of the potential tax savings to the taxpayer under the property value limitation agreement. The focus of this table is on the M&O tax rate only. A $1.17 per $100 M&O tax rate is assumed in 2014-15 (the most recent year available) and thereafter.

Under the assumptions used here, the potential tax savings from the value limitation total $19.6 million over the life of the agreement. The CISD revenue losses are expected to total approximately $3.55 million in the initial 2017-18 limitation year under the agreement, although current law anticipates a two-year payout of the revenue-loss amount. In total, the potential net tax benefits (after hold-harmless payments are made) are estimated to reach$16.0 million, prior to any agreement on supplemental payments to the District.

I&S Funding Impact on School District

The project remains fully taxable for debt services taxes, with CISD currently levying a $0.438 per $100 I&S rate. While the value of the Luminant project is expected to depreciate over the life of the agreement and beyond—especially when the 20 percent appraised value restriction for a solar project appears after the value limitation expires—full access to the additional I&S taxable value is expected to provide local taxpayers with additional help in meeting CISD's debt service needs during the formative years of the project. CISD is not expected to be eligible for state facilities funding, based on the estimates presented in this report.

The project is not expected to affect CISD in terms of enrollment. Continued expansion of the project and related development could result in additional employment in the area and an increase in the school-age population, but this project is unlikely to have much impact on a stand-alone basis.

Table 5 - Estimated Financial Impact of the Luminant Project Property Value Limitation Request Submitted to CISD at $1.1700 M&O Tax Rate

Year of Agreement	School Year	Project Value	Estimated Taxable Value	Value Savings	Assumed M&O Tax Rate	Taxes Before Value Limit	Taxes after Value Limit	Tax Savings @ Projected M&O Rate	School District Revenue Losses	Estimated Net Tax Benefits
QTP0	2015-16	$1,688,010	$1,688,010	$0	$1.170	$19,750	$19,750	$0	$0	$0
QTP1	2016-17	$39,204,890	$39,204,890	$0	$1.170	$458,697	$458,697	$0	$0	$0
QTP2/VL1	2017-18	$301,721,939	$20,000,000	$281,721,939	$1.170	$3,530,147	$234,000	$3,296,147	-$3,296,147	$0
VL2	2018-19	$277,739,158	$20,000,000	$257,739,158	$1.170	$3,249,548	$234,000	$3,015,548	-$257,915	$2,757,633
VL3	2019-20	$253,756,550	$20,000,000	$233,756,550	$1.170	$2,968,952	$234,000	$2,734,952	$0	$2,734,952
VL4	2020-21	$229,774,115	$20,000,000	$209,774,115	$1.170	$2,688,357	$234,000	$2,454,357	$0	$2,454,357
VL5	2021-22	$202,791,857	$20,000,000	$182,791,857	$1.170	$2,372,665	$234,000	$2,138,665	$0	$2,138,665
VL6	2022-23	$175,809,775	$20,000,000	$155,809,775	$1.170	$2,056,974	$234,000	$1,822,974	$0	$1,822,974
VL7	2023-24	$148,827,873	$20,000,000	$128,827,873	$1.170	$1,741,286	$234,000	$1,507,286	$0	$1,507,286
VL8	2024-25	$118,846,153	$20,000,000	$98,846,153	$1.170	$1,390,500	$234,000	$1,156,500	$0	$1,156,500
VL9	2025-26	$91,864,613	$20,000,000	$71,864,613	$1.170	$1,074,816	$234,000	$840,816	$0	$840,816
VL10	2026-27	$73,883,259	$20,000,000	$53,883,259	$1.170	$864,434	$234,000	$630,434	$0	$630,434
VP1	2027-28	$64,902,092	$64,902,092	$0	$1.075	$697,697	$697,697	$0	$0	$0
VP2	2028-29	$61,921,113	$61,921,113	$0	$1.170	$724,477	$724,477	$0	$0	$0
VP3	2029-30	$61,940,324	$61,940,324	$0	$1.170	$724,702	$724,702	$0	$0	$0
VP4	2030-31	$61,959,727	$61,959,727	$0	$1.170	$724,929	$724,929	$0	$0	$0
VP5	2031-32	$61,979,324	$61,979,324	$0	$1.170	$725,158	$725,158	$0	$0	$0
						$26,013,089	$6,415,410	$19,597,679	-$3,554,062	$16,043,617

QT=	Qualifying Time Period
VL=	Value Limitation
VP=	Viable Presence

Note: School district revenue-loss estimates are subject to change based on numerous factors, including:

- **Legislative and Texas Education Agency administrative changes to the underlying school finance formulas used in these calculations.**
- **Legislative changes addressing property value appraisals and exemptions.**
- **Year-to-year appraisals of project values and district taxable values.**
- **Changes in school district tax rates and student enrollment.**