



TERRY COUNTY APPRAISAL DISTRICT

REAPPRAISAL PLAN

FOR

2015-2016

ADOPTED BY THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS

SEPTEMBER 9, 2014

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TAX CODE REQUIREMENT

Passage of S. B. 1652 amended the Tax Code to require a written biennial reappraisal plan. The following details the changes to the Tax Code:

Section 6.05, Tax Code, is amended by adding Subsection (i) to read as follows:

(i) To ensure adherence with generally accepted appraisal practices, the Board of directors of an appraisal district shall develop biennially a written plan for the reappraisal of all property within the boundaries of the district according to the requirements of Section 25.18 and shall hold a public hearing to consider the proposed plan. Not later than the 10th day before the date of the hearing, the secretary of the board shall deliver to the presiding officer of the governing body of each taxing unit participating in the district a written notice of the date, time, and place of the hearing. Not later than September 15 of each even numbered year, the board shall complete its hearings, make any amendments, and by resolution finally approve the plan. Copies of the approved plan shall be distributed in the district and to the comptroller within 60 days of the approval date.

Plan for Periodic Reappraisal

Subsections (a) and (b), Section 25.18, Tax Code;

- a) Each appraisal office shall implement the plan for periodic reappraisal of property approved by the board of directors under Section 6.05 (i).
- b) The plan shall provide for the following reappraisal activities for all real and personal property in the district at least once every three years:
 1. Identifying properties to be appraised through physical inspection or by other reliable means of identification, including deeds or other legal documentation, aerial photographs, land-based photographs, surveys, maps, and property sketches;
 2. Identifying and updating relevant characteristics of each property in the appraisal records;
 3. Defining market areas in the district;
 4. Identifying property characteristics that affect property value in each market area, including:
 - A. The location and market area of the property;
 - B. Physical attributes of property, such as size, age, and condition;
 - C. Legal and economic attributes; and
 - D. Easements, covenants, leases, reservation, contracts, declarations, Special assessments, ordinances, or legal restrictions;
 5. Developing an appraisal model that reflects the relationship among the property characteristics affecting value in each market area and determines the contribution of individual property characteristics;
 6. Applying the conclusions reflected in the model to the characteristics of the properties being appraised; and
 7. Reviewing the appraisal results to determine value.

MARKET AREA

The market areas in the Terry County Appraisal District are defined as City of Brownfield, City of Meadow and City of Wellman. The rural areas are the Brownfield ISD area, Meadow ISD area, and Wellman-Union CISD area.

REVALUATION DECISION

The Terry County Appraisal District by policy adopted by the Chief Appraiser reappraises all real and personal property in the district at least once every three years. Tax year 2015 is a reappraisal year for residential property in city boundaries in the district. Tax year 2016 is a reappraisal year for commercial real property. Industrial, oil, gas, mineral, and business personal are reappraised each year.

REAPPRAISAL AND NON-REAPPRAISAL YEAR ACTIVITIES

1. Performance Analysis -the equalized values from the previous tax year are analyzed with ratio studies to determine the appraisal accuracy and appraisal uniformity overall and by property classes with in property categories. Ratio studies are conducted complying with Standard on Ratio Studies of the International Association of Assessing Officers.
2. Staffing and budget requirements for tax year 2015-2016 are included in the 2015-2016 budget. Being a small district, Terry CAD has consolidated field and office activities. Existing maps and data requirements are specified and updates scheduled.
3. Production standards for field activities are calculated and incorporated in the planning and scheduling process.
4. Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal system revisions required are specified with Terry CAD's software provider.
5. Field and office procedures are reviewed and revised as required for data collection. Activities scheduled for each tax year include new construction, demolition, remodeling, and field or office verification of sales data and property characteristics.
6. Pilot study -revised mass appraisal models are tested each tax year. Ratios studies are conducted on proposed values in year of reappraisal for accuracy and uniformity.
7. Using market analysis of comparable sales and locally tested cost data, valuation models are specified and calibrated with standards of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice. The calculated values are tested for accuracy and uniformity using ratio studies.
8. The Mass Appraisal Report - each tax year the tax code required Mass Appraisal Report is prepared at the conclusion of the appraisal phase of the ad valorem tax calendar. The Mass Appraisal Report complies with STANDARD RULE 6- 8 of USPAP. The certification by the Chief Appraiser is compliant with STANDARD RULE 6-9.
9. Value defense - evidence to be used by the appraisal district to meet its burden of proof for market value and equity in both informal and formal review board hearings is specified and tested.

REVALUATION DECISION

The Terry CAD by policy adopted by the Chief Appraiser reappraises all real commercial and residential property at least once every three years. Industrial real and personal, commercial personal, oil, gas, and mineral properties are reappraised every year. Terry CAD appraises property for nine (9) taxing units and six (6) overlapping school districts in an approximate 900 square mile area with an average of 9,500 real parcels. Terry CAD contracts with each non-overlapping taxing unit to collect and distribute their property tax revenue. Terry CAD employs four (4) full time employees that include the Chief Appraiser, Asst. Chief Appraiser, Office Manager/Secretary, and Collections Clerk/Data Entry.

2015 REAPPRAISAL SCHEDULE

Tax year 2015 is a reappraisal year for residential category "A" properties with-in the boundaries of the appraisal district as outlined in the schedule below;

- **August-December 2014-** Conduct physical inspection on existing residential properties as well as discovery of new properties utilizing building permits, mechanic's material's liens, and other discovery sources. Run current sales information from sales confirmation letters, deed records and other sources that might be available. Mail Business Personal Property Rendition forms in late December.
- **January 2015** – Continue with any field inspections not already conducted. Begin collecting income and expense data to aid in ag-use, net to land calculations. Mail any homestead applications, special-use valuations, or sales letters not already sent.
- **January-March 2015** – Complete field inspections and run sales ratio reports. Compare with CAD values and sales information. Identify necessary schedule adjustments.
- **March-April 2015** – Continue running sales ratio reports. Refine sales analysis and mass appraisal schedules. Statistically test schedule. Complete data entry of all reappraisal and maintenance changes. Finalize all field work and data collection activities. Execute mass appraisal/maintenance activities as required. Prepare for mailing 2015 Notices of Appraised value as required by Tex. Prop. Tax Code §25.19.
- **May 2015** – Mail Notice of Appraised value for each account in Terry County.
- **June-July** – ARB meets during these months. Process and mail ARB order. Enter into computer all changes as ordered by ARB and notify other CAD's if the ordered change falls into an over-lapping area. ARB Approval of records by July 20th. Certification of appraisal records and values to taxing unity by July 25th.
- **As needed throughout the year** – Address any outstanding protests by scheduling ARB hearings.

2016 REAPPRAISAL SCHEDULE

The same timetable and duties apply in each year with a greater emphasis on Commercial Real Property. The CAD staff will continue to complete the same duties and reappraisal steps as outlined for 2015.

PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS

In each tax year 2015-2016 the previous tax year's equalized values are analyzed utilizing ratio studies to determine appraisal accuracy and appraisal uniformity overall and by property classes within state property categories. Mean, median, and weighted mean ratios are calculated for properties in each reporting category to measure the level of appraisal. The mean ratio is calculated in each market class for level of appraisal. In reappraisal and non-reappraisal years, analysis is used to develop the starting point for establishing the level and accuracy of appraisal performance.

ANALYSIS OF AVAILABLE RESOURCES

Since Terry CAD is a small district, appraisal activities are consolidated within the office. Field inspections are made by field appraisers. Cap rates are derived from sales of commercial real property types when available, otherwise rates are estimated from previous information and data. Personal property density schedules are tested and analyzed based upon rendition and prior year hearing documentation. Mass appraisal support is detailed from legislative changes and specific functions of the district.

PLANNING AND ORGANIZATION

Appraisal and reappraisal field and office activities are consolidated within Terry CAD since we are a small district.

REAL PROPERTY VALUATION

Revisions to cost models, income models, and market models are updated and tested at least once every three years. Cost schedules are tested with market data to insure that the appraisal district is in compliance with Texas Property Tax Code, Section 23.011. Replacement cost new tables as well as depreciation tables are tested for accuracy and uniformity using ratio study tools and compared with cost data from Marshall & Swift. Land tables are updated using current market data (sales) and then tested with ratio study tools. Value Modifiers are developed for property categories by market area and tested on a pilot basis with ratio study tools. Income, expense, and occupancy data is compiled from property owners and other data which is sometime confidential.

PERSONAL PROPERTY VALUATION

Density schedules are updated using data received during the previous tax year from confidential rendition. Valuation procedures are reviewed, modified as needed and tested.

NOTICING PROCESS

25.19-appraisal notice forms are reviewed and edited for updates and changes signed off on by appraisal district management. Updates include the latest copy of Comptrollers Taxpayers rights, remedies, and responsibilities.

HEARING PROCESS

Protest hearing scheduling for informal and formal Appraisal Review Board hearings are reviewed and updated as required. Standards of documentation are reviewed and amended as required. The appraisal district hearing documentation is reviewed and updated to reflect the current valuation process. Production of documentation is tested and compliance with HB 201 is insured.

DATA COLLECTION REQUIREMENTS

Field and office procedures are reviewed and revised as required for data collection. Activities scheduled for each tax year include new construction, demolition, remodeling, and inspection from data such as building permits.

NEW CONSTRUCTION / DEMOLITION

New construction and demolitions are inspected per building permits and mechanics and builders liens.

REMODELING

Remolding of improvements are identified through building permits, mechanics liens, and owners information. Any updates to value are calculated against similar properties.

RE-INSPECTION OF PROBLEM AREAS AND PROPERTIES

Property inspections are conducted on a continuing basis.

FIELD OR OFFICE VERIFICATION OF SALES DATA AND PROPERTY CHARACTERISTICS

Sales information is verified when possible through buyers and sellers information and other sources. Property characteristics are filed as of date of sale.

PILOT STUDY

New and/or revised mass appraisal models are tested on randomly selected market areas. These modeling tests (sales ratio studies) are conducted each tax year. Test results are compared with anticipated results and those models not performing are refined and retested. The procedures used for model specification and model calibration are in compliance with USPAP, STANDARD RULE 6_

VALUATION BY TAX YEAR

Valuation by tax year-using market analysis of comparable sale and locally tested cost data, valuation models are specified and calibrated in compliance with the supplemental standards from the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice. The calculated values are tested for accuracy and uniformity using ratio studies. Property values in all market areas are updated each reappraisal year as necessary. Tax years 2015 and 2016 are reappraisal years.

RESIDENTIAL REAL PROPERTY

Among the three approaches to value, residential real property is calculated using the replacement cost new approach less depreciation adjusted to sales comparison data.

SPECIAL INVENTORY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY

Among the three approaches to value, cost, income, and market, the sales comparison method is used to calculate projected sale prices. The cost approach method is then used for the estimated cost for development, overhead, and profit margin. The difference is the estimated value.

MULTIFAMILY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY

Among the three approaches to value, cost, income, and market, all three are used to estimate value depending upon information available to the appraiser. More weight is used upon the market approach if reliable sale information is available.

COMMERCIAL REAL PROPERTY

Among the three approaches to value, cost, income, and market, the market comparison is used if reliable sales are available to best reflect what buyers and sellers are doing. If sufficient income data is available, weight is put on this approach for similar properties. If the property is new, cost data from Marshall & Swift is reliable.

VACANT REAL PROPERTY

Among the three approaches to value, cost, income, market, the market approach is used to value real property.

INDUSTRIAL REAL PROPERTY

Terry CAD contracts with the Capitol Appraisal Group, Inc. for these appraisals. See attached Reappraisal Plan.

UTILITIES

Terry CAD contracts with the Capitol Appraisal Group, Inc. for these appraisals. See attached Reappraisal Plan.

MINERAL INTEREST

Terry CAD contracts with the Capitol Appraisal Group, Inc. for these appraisals. See attached Reappraisal Plan.

SPECIAL VALUATION PROPERTIES

Agricultural use is valued according to Section 23.51, Section 23.52, and Section 23.53 of THE TEXAS PROPERTY TAX CODE using a five year net to land to the landlord on a share lease basis which is typical in Terry County.

BUSINESS TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY

Among the three approaches to value, cost, income, and market, the replacement cost new less depreciation (cost) method is used. Other documents, such as confidential renditions, and information from property owners are used. Density schedules are inspected and updated yearly.

THE MASS APPRAISAL REPORT

Each tax year the tax code required Mass Appraisal Report is prepared and certified by the Chief Appraiser at the conclusion of the appraisal phase of the ad valorem tax calendar (on or about May 15th). The Mass Appraisal Report is completed in compliance with STANDARD RULE 6-8 of the UNIFORM STANDARDS OF PROFESSIONAL APPRAISAL PRACTICE. The signed certification by the Chief Appraiser is compliant with STANDARD RULE 6-9 of USPAP.

VALUE DEFENSE

Evidence to be used by the appraisal district to meet its burden of proof for market value and equity in both informal and formal appraisal review board hearings is specified and tested. Evidence used in meeting burden of proof is sales data, unless confidential, documents from property owners and sellers, recorded data, schedules of models, ratio studies, cost data of models, and relevant information the district deems necessary.

(ADDENDUM)

CAPITOL APPRAISAL GROUP INC

REAPPRAISAL PLAN

2015-2016

Document 7A

MASS APPRAISAL REPORT

INDUSTRIAL PROPERTY

APPRAISED BY CAPITOL APPRAISAL GROUP

2015 - 2016

Overview

This type of property consists of processing facilities and related personal property. Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC is contracted to reappraise this type of property according to the scope of work in the normal course of business of the client consistent with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice guidelines. The completed appraisals are all retrospective in nature. The purpose of the appraisals is to estimate market value as of January 1 in accordance with the definition of market value established in the Texas Property Tax Code (Sec. 1.04). "Market value" means the price at which a property would transfer for cash or its equivalent under prevailing market conditions if:

- A. exposed for sale in the open market with a reasonable time for the seller to find a purchaser;
- B. both the seller and the purchaser know of all the uses and purposes to which the property is adapted and for which it is capable of being used and of the enforceable restrictions on its use; and
- C. both the seller and purchaser seek to maximize their gains and neither is in a position to take advantage of the exigencies of the other.

The effective date of the appraisals is January 1 of the year for which this report is submitted unless the property owner or agent has applied for and been granted September 1 inventory valuation as allowed by Section 23.12(f) of the Texas Property Tax Code. The date of this report is April 20 of the tax year for which it is submitted.

The client for the mass appraisal is the Texas appraisal district named on the last page of this report. The intended users of this report are the client and the property owners of the client appraisal district.

The appraisal results will be used as the tax base upon which a property tax will be levied. The properties are appraised in fee simple in conformance with the Texas Property Tax Code Sec. 25.06. This is a jurisdictional exception to the Standards Rule 6-5 © Comment of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice 2008. A listing of the industrial properties appraised by Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC for the appraisal district is available at the appraisal district office. Industrial properties are normally re-inspected annually.

Documents relevant to an understanding of these appraisals include the confidential rendition, if any, filed with the appraisal district by the owner or agent of the property; other reports described in the Texas Property Tax Code; asset lists and other confidential data supplied by the owner or agent; the General Appraisal Manual adopted by the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts; Property Assessment Valuation published by the International Association of Assessing Officers and adopted by the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts; and Engineering Valuation and Depreciation by Marston, Winfrey, and Hempstead; and the Texas Property Tax Code.

Capitol's industrial appraisal staff includes licensed engineers as well as experienced appraisers who are knowledgeable in all three approaches to value. Industrial appraisal staff stays abreast of current trends affecting industrial properties through review of published materials, attendance at conferences, course work, and continuing education. All industrial appraisers are registered with the Texas Board of Tax Professional Examiners.

Assumptions and Limiting Conditions

All appraisals are subject to the following assumptions and limiting conditions:

1. Title to the property is assumed to be good and marketable and the legal description correct.
2. No responsibility for legal matters is assumed. All existing liens, mortgages, or other encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management.
3. The appraisers developing these appraisals are not requested to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of the appraisals, unless directed by, employed by, and provided legal counsel by the Appraisal District.
4. The appraisers do not necessarily inspect every property every year.
5. All sketches on the appraisal documents are intended to be visual aids and should not be construed as surveys or engineering reports unless otherwise specified.
6. All information in the appraisal documents has been obtained by members of Capitol Appraisal Group's staff or by other reliable sources.
7. The appraisals were prepared exclusively for ad valorem tax purposes. As such some valuation formulas may be required by the property tax code as opposed to generally accepted appraisal practices.
8. The appraisers have inspected as far as possible, by observation, the improvements being appraised, however, it is not possible to personally observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. Therefore no representations are made as to these matters unless specifically considered in an individual appraisal.

Data Collection and Validation

Data on the subject properties is collected as part of the inspection process and through later submissions by the property owner. Submitted data may be on a rendition form or in other modes which require confidentiality. Subject property data is verified through previously existing records and through published reports. Additional data are obtained and verified through published sources, regulatory reports, and through analysis of comparable properties, if any. Due to the unique nature of many industrial properties there is no standard data collection form or manual.

Valuation Approach and Analysis

Industrial properties are appraised using replacement/reproduction cost new less depreciation models. Replacement costs are estimated from published sources, other publicly available information, and comparable properties. Reproduction costs are based on actual investment in the subject or comparable properties adjusted for typical changes in cost over time. Depreciation is calculated on the age/life method using typical economic lives and depreciation rates based on published sources, market evidence, and the experience of knowledgeable appraisers. Adjustments for functional and economic obsolescence may be made if utilization and income data for the subject property justify such. Income Approach models (direct capitalization and discounted cash flow) are also used when economic and/or subject property income information is available. Capitalization and discount rates are based on published capital costs for the industry of the subject property. A market data model based on typical selling prices per unit of capacity is also used when appropriate market sales information is available.

Because cost information is the most readily available type of data, the cost approach model is always considered and used. If sufficient data is available either of both of the other two models may also be considered and used. The market data and income approach models may need to be reduced by the value of the land in order to arrive at a value of improvements and personal property.

Model calibration in the cost approach involves the selection of the appropriate service life for each type or class of property. Further calibration can occur through the use of utilization or through-put data provided by the owner or agent. Income approach calibration involves the selection of the cost of capital or discount rate appropriate to the type of property being appraised as well as adjusting the projected income stream to reflect the individual characteristics of the subject property. Model calibration in the market data approach involves adjusting sales prices of comparable properties to reflect the individual characteristics of the subject property.

The mathematical form of each model is described below.

Cost Approach

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{RCN} \\ & -\text{PD} \\ & -\text{FO} \\ & \underline{-\text{EO}} \\ & =\text{Cost Indicator of Value} \end{aligned}$$

Where:

RCN = Replacement or Reproduction Cost New

PD = Physical Depreciation

FO = Functional Obsolescence

EO = Economic Obsolescence

Income Approach

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{PGR} \\ & -\text{VCL} \\ & -\text{FE} \\ & \underline{-\text{VE}} \\ & \text{NOI} \end{aligned}$$

NOI/R = Income Indicator of Value

Where:

NOI = Net Operating Income

PGR = Potential Gross Rent

VCL = Vacancy and Collection Loss

FE = Fixed Expenses

VE = Variable Expenses

R = Discount Rate or Cost of Capital

A variation of the income model is:

NOI for year 1 x DF for year 1 = PW of year 1 NOI

NOI for year n x DF for year n = PW of year n NOI

Net Reversion x DF for year n = PW of Reversion

Sum of PW's for all years 1 - n = Income Indicator of Value

Where:

DF = Discount Factor

PW = Present Worth

n = Last year of holding period

Market Data Approach

$$\text{ASPCP}/\text{U} = \text{PU}$$

$$\text{PU} \times \text{SU} = \text{Market Data Indicator of Value}$$

Where:

ASPCP = Adjusted Sales Price of Comparable Property

U = Unit of comparison

PU = Price per Unit of comparison

ASPU = Adjusted Sales Price per Unit of comparison

SU = Subject Property's number of Units of comparison

In reconciling multiple model results for a property the appraiser considers the model results that best address the individual characteristics of the subject property and that are based on the most reliable data while maintaining equalization among like properties. Final results for each property may be found on the appraisal district's appraisal roll.

Land valuation for industrial properties is the responsibility of appraisal district staff as is the highest and best use analysis of the site. Sites are analyzed for highest and best use as though they were vacant. Highest and best use analysis of the improvements is based on the likelihood of the continued use of the improvements in their current and/or intended use. An appraiser's identification of a property's highest and best use is always a statement of opinion, never a statement of fact.

Review and Testing

Field review of appraisals is performed through the regular inspection of subject properties. The periodic reassignment of properties among appraisers or the review of appraisals by an experienced appraiser also contributes to the review process. A computer-assisted statistical review of property value changes is also conducted.

Appraisal-to-sales ratios are the preferred method for measuring performance, however sales are very infrequent. Furthermore, market transactions normally occur for multiple sites and include both real and personal property, tangible and intangible, making analysis difficult and subjective. Performance is also measured through comparison with valid single-property appraisals submitted for staff review. Lastly, Capitol Appraisal Group's industrial appraisal methods and procedures are subject to review by the Property Tax Division of the Texas Comptroller's office. The Comptroller's review as well as comparisons with single-property appraisals indicate the validity of the models and the calibration techniques employed.

Document 7B

MASS APPRAISAL REPORT

BUSINESS PERSONAL PROPERTY

APPRAISED BY CAPITOL APPRAISAL GROUP

2015 - 2016

Overview

This type of property consists of tangible personal property owned by a business or individual for the purpose of producing an income. The Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal practice define personal property as “identifiable portable and tangible objects which are considered by the general public as being “personal,” e.g. furnishings, artwork, antiques, gems and jewelry, collectibles, machinery and equipment; all property that is not classified as real estate.” The Texas Property Tax Code (Sec. 1.04(5)) defines tangible personal property as “...personal property that can be seen, weighed, measured, felt, or otherwise perceived by the senses but does not include a document or other perceptible object that constitutes evidence of a valuable interest, claim, or right and has negligible or no intrinsic value.” The Texas Property Tax Code (Sec. 1.04(4)) defines personal property as “...property that is not real property.”

Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC is contracted to reappraise this type of property according to the scope of work in the normal course of business of the client consistent with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice guidelines. The completed appraisals are all retrospective in nature. The purpose of the appraisals is to estimate market value as of January 1 in accordance with the definition of market value established in the Texas Property Tax Code (Sec. 1.04). “Market value” means the price at which a property would transfer for cash or its equivalent under prevailing market conditions if:

- A. exposed for sale in the open market with a reasonable time for the seller to find a purchaser;
- B. both the seller and the purchaser know of all the uses and purposes to which the property is adapted and for which it is capable of being used and of the enforceable restrictions on its use; and
- C. both the seller and purchaser seek to maximize their gains and neither is in a position to take advantage of the exigencies of the other.

A separate definition of the value of inventory is found in the Texas Property Tax Code (Sec. 23.12(a)), “...the market value of an inventory is the price for which it would sell as a unit to a purchaser who would continue the business.” Additionally, some inventories may qualify for appraisal as of September 1 in accordance with the provisions of Texas Property Tax Code Section 23.12(f).

The effective date of the appraisals is January 1 of the year for which this report is submitted unless the property owner or agent has applied for and been granted September 1 inventory valuation as allowed by Section 23.12(f) of the Texas Property Tax Code. The date of this report is April 20 of the tax year for which it is submitted.

The client for the mass appraisal is the Texas appraisal district named on the last page of this report. The intended users of this report are the client and the property owners of the client appraisal district.

The appraisal results will be used as the tax base upon which a property tax will be levied. A listing of the personal property appraised by Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC for the appraisal district is available at the appraisal district office. Personal property is normally re-inspected annually.

Documents relevant to an understanding of these appraisals include the confidential rendition, if any, filed with the appraisal district by the owner or agent of the property; other reports described in the Texas Property tax Code; asset lists and other confidential data supplied by the owner or agent; Property Assessment Valuation published by the International Association of Assessing Officers and adopted by the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts; and Engineering Valuation and Depreciation by Marston, Winfrey, and Hempstead; and the Texas Property Tax Code.

Capitol's personal property appraisal staff includes licensed engineers as well as experienced appraisers who are knowledgeable in all three approaches to value. Personal property appraisal staff stays abreast of current trends affecting personal property through review of published materials, attendance at conferences, course work, and continuing education. All personal property appraisers are registered with the Texas Board of Tax Professional Examiners.

Assumptions and Limiting Conditions

All appraisals are subject to the following assumptions and limiting conditions:

1. Title to the property is assumed to be good and marketable and the legal description correct.
2. No responsibility for legal matters is assumed. All existing liens, mortgages, or other encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management.
3. The appraisers developing these appraisals are not Requested to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of the appraisals, unless directed by, employed by, and provided legal counsel by the Appraisal District.
4. The appraisers do not necessarily inspect every property every year.
5. All sketches on the appraisal documents are intended to be visual aids and should not be construed as surveys or engineering reports unless otherwise specified.
6. All information in the appraisal documents has been obtained by members of Capitol Appraisal Group's staff or by other reliable sources.

7. The appraisals were prepared exclusively for ad valorem tax purposes. As such some valuation formulas may be required by the property tax code as opposed to generally accepted appraisal practices.

Data Collection and Validation

Data on the subject properties are collected as part of the inspection process and through later submissions by the property owner. Submitted data may be on a rendition form or in other modes which require confidentiality. Subject property data is verified through previously existing records and through published reports. Additional data are obtained and verified through published sources, regulatory reports, and through analysis of comparable properties. Due to the multitude of personal property types there is no standard data collection form or manual.

Valuation Approach and Analysis

Personal property is appraised using replacement/reproduction cost new less depreciation models. Replacement costs are estimated from published sources, other publicly available information, and comparable properties. Reproduction costs are based on actual investment in the subject or comparable properties. Depreciation is calculated on the age/life method using typical economic lives and depreciation rates based on published sources, market evidence, and the experience of knowledgeable appraisers. Adjustments for functional and economic obsolescence may be made if utilization and income data for the subject property justify such. Income Approach models (direct capitalization and discounted cash flow) are also used when economic and/or subject property income information is available. Capitalization and discount rates are based on published capital costs for the industry of the subject property. A value estimate derived from an income approach model in which the operating income of a business was capitalized must be reduced by the value of any real property in order to arrive at the value of the operating personal property. A market data model based on typical selling prices per item or unit of capacity is also used when appropriate market sales information is available. In the case of some personal property types, such as licensed vehicles, market data from published pricing guides is used to construct a market value model. In other cases, models are based on sales information available through published sources or through private sources.

Because cost information is the most readily available type of data, the cost approach model is always considered and used. If sufficient data is available either of both of the other two models may also be considered and used. The market data and income approach models may need to be reduced by the value of the land in order to arrive at a value of improvements and personal property.

Model calibration in the cost approach involves the selection of the appropriate service life for each type or class of property. Further calibration can occur through the use of utilization or through-put data provided by the owner or agent. Income approach calibration involves the selection of the cost of capital or discount rate appropriate to the

type of property being appraised as well as adjusting the projected income stream to reflect the individual characteristics of the subject property. Model calibration in the market data approach involves adjusting sales prices of comparable properties to reflect the individual characteristics of the subject property.

The mathematical form of each model is described below.

Cost Approach

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{RCN} \\ & -\text{PD} \\ & -\text{FO} \\ & \underline{-\text{EO}} \\ & =\text{Cost Indicator of Value} \end{aligned}$$

Where:

RCN = Replacement or Reproduction Cost New

PD = Physical Depreciation

FO = Functional Obsolescence

EO = Economic Obsolescence

Income Approach

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{PGR} \\ & -\text{VCL} \\ & -\text{FE} \\ & \underline{-\text{VE}} \\ & \text{NOI} \end{aligned}$$

NOI/R = Income Indicator of Value

Where:

PGR = Potential Gross Rent

VCL = Vacancy and Collection Loss

FE = Fixed Expenses

VE = Variable Expenses

R = Discount Rate or Cost of Capital

A variation of the income model is:

NOI for year 1 x DF for year 1 = PW of year 1 NOI

NOI for year n x DF for year n = PW of year n NOI

Net Reversion x DF for year n = PW of Reversion

Sum of PW's for all years 1 - n = Income Indicator of Value

Where:

NOI = Net Operating Income

DF = Discount Factor
PW = Present Worth
n = Last year of holding period

Market Data Approach

ASPCP/U = PU
PU x SU = Market Data Indicator of Value

Where:

ASPCP = Adjusted Sales Price of Comparable Property

U = Unit of comparison

ASPU = Adjusted Sales Price per Unit of comparison

SU = Subject Property's number of Units of comparison

In reconciling multiple model results for a property the appraiser considers the model results that best address the individual characteristics of the subject property and that are based on the most reliable data while maintaining equalization among like properties. Final results for each property may be found on the appraisal district's appraisal roll.

Highest and best use analysis of personal property is based on the likelihood of the continued use of the personal property in its current and/or intended use. An appraiser's identification of a property's highest and best use is always a statement of opinion, never a statement of fact.

Review and Testing

Field review of appraisals is performed through the regular inspection of subject properties. The periodic reassignment of properties among appraisers or the review of appraisals by an experienced appraiser also contributes to the review process. A computer-assisted statistical review of property value changes is also conducted.

Appraisal-to-sales ratios are the preferred method for measuring performance and are used when possible. However sales for some types of personal property are very infrequent. Furthermore, many market transactions occur for multiple sites and include both real and personal property, tangible and intangible, making analysis difficult and subjective. Performance is also measured through comparison with valid single-property appraisals submitted for staff review. Lastly, Capitol Appraisal Group's industrial appraisal methods and procedures for real and personal property are subject to review by the Property Tax Division of the Texas Comptroller's office. The Comptroller's review as well as appraisal-to-sale ratios and comparisons with single-property appraisals indicate the validity of the models and the calibration techniques employed. Commercial personal property appraised by Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC is not subject to a methods and procedures review however it is included in the Property Tax Division's annual ratio study with satisfactory results.

Document 7C

MASS APPRAISAL REPORT

UTILITY, RAILROAD, AND PIPELINE PROPERTIES

APPRAISED BY CAPITOL APPRAISAL GROUP

2015 - 2016

Overview

This type of property consists of operating property, excluding land, owned by utility, railroad, and pipeline companies, and related personal property and improvements. Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC is contracted to reappraise this type of property according to the scope of work in the normal course of business of the client consistent with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice guidelines. The completed appraisals are all retrospective in nature. The purpose of the appraisals is to estimate market value as of January 1 in accordance with the definition of market value established in the Texas Property Tax Code (Sec. 1.04). "Market value" means the price at which a property would transfer for cash or its equivalent under prevailing market conditions if:

- A. exposed for sale in the open market with a reasonable time for the seller to find a purchaser;
- B. both the seller and the purchaser know of all the uses and purposes to which the property is adapted and for which it is capable of being used and of the enforceable restrictions on its use; and
- C. both the seller and purchaser seek to maximize their gains and neither is in a position to take advantage of the exigencies of the other.

The effective date of the appraisals is January 1 of the year for which this report is submitted unless the property owner or agent has applied for and been granted September 1 inventory valuation as allowed by Section 23.12(f) of the Texas Property Tax Code. The date of this report is April 20 of the tax year for which it is submitted.

The client for the mass appraisal is the Texas appraisal district named on the last page of this report. The intended users of this report are the client and the property owners of the client appraisal district

The appraisal results will be used as the tax base upon which a property tax will be levied. The properties are appraised in fee simple in conformance with the Texas Property Tax Code Sec. 25.06. This is a jurisdictional exception to Standards Rule 6-5 (c) comment of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice 2008. A listing of the utility, railroad, and pipeline properties appraised by Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC for the appraisal district is available at the appraisal district office. Such utility,

railroad, and pipeline properties that are susceptible to inspection (e.g. compressor stations, pump stations, buildings, and power plants) are normally re-inspected at least every three years.

Capitol's utility, railroad, and pipeline appraisal staff includes licensed engineers as well as experienced appraisers who are knowledgeable in all three approaches to value. The appraisal staff stays abreast of current trends affecting utility, railroad, and pipeline properties through review of published materials, attendance at conferences, course work, and continuing education. All appraisers are registered with the Texas Board of Tax Professional Examiners.

Assumptions and Limiting Conditions

All appraisals are subject to the following assumptions and limiting conditions:

1. Title to the property is assumed to be good and marketable and the legal description correct.
2. No responsibility for legal matters is assumed. All existing liens, mortgages, or other encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management.
3. The appraisers developing these appraisals are not Requested to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of the appraisals, unless directed by, employed by, and provided legal counsel by the Appraisal District.
4. The appraisers do not necessarily inspect every property every year.
5. All sketches on the appraisal documents are intended to be visual aids and should not be construed as surveys or engineering reports unless otherwise specified.
6. All information in the appraisal documents has been obtained by members of Capitol Appraisal Group's staff or by other reliable sources.
7. The appraisals were prepared exclusively for ad valorem tax purposes. As such some valuation formulas may be required by the property tax code as opposed to generally accepted appraisal practices.
8. The appraisers have inspected as far as possible, by observation, the improvements being appraised, however, it is not possible to personally observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. Therefore no representations are made as to these matters unless specifically considered in an individual appraisal.

Data Collection and Validation

Data on the subject properties is collected as part of the inspection process and through later submissions by the property owner. Submitted data may be on a rendition form or in other modes which require confidentiality. Subject property data is verified through previously existing records and through published reports. Additional data are obtained and verified through published sources, regulatory reports, and through analysis of comparable properties. Due to the varied nature of utility, railroad, and pipeline properties there is no standard data collection form or manual.

Valuation Approach and Analysis

For all pipelines a value is calculated using a Replacement Cost New Less Depreciation (RCNLD) model. This involves first calculating the cost of building a new pipeline of equal utility using current prices. The Replacement Cost New (RCN) is a function of location, length, diameter, and composition. Depreciation is then subtracted from RCN to produce the final value estimate. Depreciation is defined as the loss of value resulting from any cause. The three common forms of depreciation are physical, functional, and economic. Physical depreciation is accounted for on the basis of the age of the subject pipeline. Functional and economic obsolescence (depreciation) can be estimated through

the use of survivor curves or other normative techniques. Specific calculations to estimate abnormal functional and/or economic obsolescence can be made on the basis of the typical utilization of the subject pipeline.

After deductions from RCN have been made for all three forms of depreciation the remainder is the RCNLD or cost approach model indicator of value.

In addition to the RCNLD indicator, a unit value model may also be used for those pipelines for which appropriate income statements and balance sheets are also available. Generally, this model is used for those pipelines that by regulation are considered to be common carriers. The unit value model must be calculated for the entire pipeline system. The unit value model typically involves an income approach to value and a rate base cost approach. The income approach is based on a projection of expected future typical net operating income (NOI). The projected NOI is discounted to a present worth using a current cost of capital that is both typical of the industry and reflective of the risks inherent in the subject property. The unit value model cost approach is typically an estimation of the current rate base of the subject pipeline (total investment less book depreciation allowed under the current form of regulation). An additional calculation is made to detect and estimate economic obsolescence. Any economic obsolescence is deducted from the rate base cost less book depreciation to achieve a final cost indicator. The unit value model may also include a stock and debt approach in lieu of a market data approach. The stock and debt approach involves finding the total value of the owner's liabilities (equity and debt) and assuming that they are equal to the value of the assets. The two (or three, if the stock and debt approach is included) unit value indicators are then reconciled into a final unit appraisal model indicator of value. The unit value must then be reconciled with the RCNLD model indicator of value for the entire pipeline system being appraised. The final correlated value of the system can then be allocated among the various components of the system to determine the tax roll value for each pipeline segment.

Utility and railroad properties are appraised in a manner similar to pipeline except the RCNLD model is not used. For all three types of property (utility, railroad, and pipeline) the appraiser must first form an opinion of highest and best use. If the highest and best use of the operating property is the current use under current regulation, the unit value model is considered highly appropriate. If the highest and best use is something different, then the RCNLD model may be more appropriate.

Compressor stations, pump stations, improvements, and related facilities are appraised using a replacement cost new less depreciation model.

Model calibration in the RCNLD model involves the selection of the appropriate service life for each type or class of property. Further calibration can occur through the use of utilization or through-put data provided by the owner or agent. Model calibration in the unit value cost approach involves the selection of the appropriate items to include in the rate base calculation and selection of the best measure of obsolescence, if any. Income approach calibration involves the selection of the cost of capital or discount rate

appropriate to the type of property being appraised as well as adjusting the projected income stream to reflect the individual characteristics of the subject property. Model calibration in the stock and debt approach involves allocating sales prices of debt and equity to reflect the contribution to value of the operating property of the subject company.

The mathematical form of each model is described below.

RCNLD Approach

$$\begin{array}{r} \text{RCN} \\ -\text{PD} \\ -\text{FO} \\ \underline{-\text{EO}} \\ =\text{RCNLD Indicator of Value} \end{array}$$

Where:

RCN = Replacement or Reproduction Cost New

PD = Physical Depreciation

FO = Functional Obsolescence

EO = Economic Obsolescence

Unit Cost Approach

$$\begin{array}{r} \text{OC} \\ -\text{AD} \\ \underline{-\text{EO}} \\ =\text{Unit Cost Approach Indicator of Value} \end{array}$$

Where:

OC = Original Cost

AD = Allowed Depreciation

EO = Economic Obsolescence

Unit Income Approach

$$\begin{array}{r} \text{PGR} \\ -\text{VCL} \\ -\text{FE} \\ \underline{-\text{VE}} \\ \text{NOI} \end{array}$$

NOI/R = Income Indicator of Value

Where:

PGR = Potential Gross Rent

VCL = Vacancy and Collection Loss
FE = Fixed Expenses
VE = Variable Expenses
R = Discount Rate or Cost of Capital

A variation of the income model is:

NOI for year 1 x DF for year 1 = PW of year 1 NOI
NOI for year n x DF for year n = PW of year n NOI
Net Reversion x DF for year n = PW of Reversion
Sum of PW's for all years 1 - n = Income Indicator of Value

Where:

NOI = Net Operating Income
DF = Discount Factor
PW = Present Worth
n = Last year of holding period

Stock and Debt Approach

MVE
+MVD
=Market Value of Assets

Where:

MVE = Market value of Equity
MVD = Market value of Debt

In reconciling multiple model results for a property the appraiser considers the model results that best address the individual characteristics of the subject property while maintaining equalization among like properties. Final results for each property may be found on the appraisal district's appraisal roll.

Land valuation for utility and pipeline properties is the responsibility of appraisal district staff as is the highest and best use analysis of the site. Sites are analyzed for highest and best use as though they were vacant. Highest and best use analysis of the improvements is based on the likelihood of the continued use of the improvements in their current and/or intended use. Railroad corridor land is included in the appraisal of the operating property. The highest and best use of railroad corridor land is presumed to be as operating property. An appraiser's identification of a property's highest and best use is always a statement of opinion, never a statement of fact.

The rate-base cost approach, stock and debt approach, and income approach models must be reduced by the value of the land in order to arrive at a value of improvements, personal property, and other operating property.

Review and Testing

Field review of appraisals is performed through the regular inspection of subject properties. The periodic reassignment of properties among appraisers or the review of appraisals by an experienced appraiser also contributes to the review process. A computer-assisted statistical review of property value changes is also conducted.

Appraisal to sales ratios are the preferred method for measuring performance, however sales are very infrequent. Furthermore, market transactions normally occur for multiple sites and include both real and personal property, tangible and intangible, making analysis difficult and subjective. Performance is also measured through comparison with valid single-property appraisals submitted for staff review. Appraisal results are tested annually by the Property Tax Division of the Texas Comptroller's Office. The Comptroller's review as well as comparisons with single-property appraisals indicate the validity of the models as well as the calibration techniques employed.

Document 7D

MASS APPRAISAL REPORT

OIL AND GAS RESERVES

CAPITOL APPRAISAL GROUP

2015 - 2016

Overview

Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC (CAGL) contracts with Appraisal Districts and other governmental entities to appraise all oil & gas subsurface, producing, mineral interests within the purview of the entity. The contractual purpose is to estimate market value as defined in Section 1.04 of the Texas Property Tax Code as of January 1 of each year and report these values to the entity. The results of our work are used as part of the tax base upon which property taxes are levied. Each mineral interest is listed on the appraisal roll separately from other interests in the minerals-in-place in conformance with the Texas Property Tax Code Sec. 25.12. Subsurface mineral rights are not susceptible to physical inspection. This condition creates the need to invoke the **Departure Provision** as Requested by the 2003 edition of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice Standards Rule 6-7 (f). However, the inability to physically examine the subsurface mineral rights does not appreciably affect the appraisal process or the quality of the results.

Assumptions and Limiting Factors

All appraisals are subject to the following:

1. Title to the property is assumed to be good and marketable and the ownership interest and legal description is assumed to be correct.
2. No responsibility for legal matters is assumed. Properties are appraised as if free and clear of any encumbrance and operated under responsible ownership and competent management.
3. Not every property is inspected every year.
4. All information in the appraisal documents has been obtained by Capitol Appraisal Group's employees or through other reliable sources.

5. The appraisals were prepared exclusively for ad valorem tax purposes. As such some valuation formulas may be required by the property tax code as opposed to generally accepted appraisal practices.

Data Collection

Data on the properties appraised are collected from regulatory agencies, such as the Texas Railroad Commission and the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts, from submissions by the property operator or owner(s), or from other sources. **Submitted data from operators, taxpayers and/or their agents on the appraised properties are considered “rendition statements” and, as such, are confidential data, subject to Sec. 22.27 of the Texas Property Tax Code.** Additional data are obtained through published sources, regulatory reports, public investment reports, licensed data services, service for fee organizations and through comparable properties, if any. The state of Texas is a non-disclosure state and thus many forms of information, pertinent to the value of the properties, are not available to the appraiser.

Valuation and Analysis

The Income Method of Appraisal, as described in Section 23.012 of the Texas Property Tax Code, is the principal appraisal method used. The Market Data Comparison Method of Appraisal (section 23.013) and the Cost Method of Appraisal (section 23.011) are considered. Industry averages of reserve replacement cost and acquisition cost are used for comparative purposes. The non-disclosure nature of the laws of Texas makes market data comparison unreliable. However, if within the scope of Capitol’s work assignment market sales disclosures on interests are available, then those data is considered. The nearly exclusive reliance on the income approach, using the discounted cash flow (DCF) technique adjusted for specific property risk and market conditions, is typical of the oil and gas industry. Fee for service organizations are used for survey data with respect to price expectations and discount rates, and licensed data services are used for Industry indicators detailing costs, income, acquisitions costs in dollars per barrel of oil equivalent (\$/BOE), finding and development costs (\$/BOE) and reserve replacement costs (\$/BOE) for over 100 E&P companies.

Due to the demands of Section 23.175 of the Texas Property Tax Code and the Texas Constitution, Capitol Appraisal Group, LLC takes great care to not appraise properties in excess of their fair market value. We analyze a segment of the Petroleum Producing E&P market, determining the impact on their stock and debt value of the pricing requirements of Sec. 23.175 and also the pricing that could be reasonably anticipated from the market. Capitol Appraisal Group LLC’s opinion of oil and gas prices is guided by the market’s anticipation of those prices through the futures market, oil and gas stock prices and oil and gas industry indexes. A base discount rate is developed using the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) 10k Standard Measure of Value, Before

Federal Income Tax (BFIT), for a grouping of 20 Exploration and Production (E&P) companies, and then matching their 10k Standard Measure of Value (BFIT), reserves and costs, through a discounted cash flow (DCF) technique. This reserve and cost match is used with Capitol's developed pricing scenario and Section 23.175 pricing directives to determine a discount rate necessary to equal the stock and debt value of the companies, as of January 1 for a given tax year.

The Weighted Average Cost of Capital (WACC) technique is also performed for a subset of these companies grouped according to the Petroleum Producing Industry Exploration and Production companies used in the *The Valueline Investment Survey*. These separate pricing scenarios and the resulting discount rates derived from using the aforementioned stock and debt techniques are applied to the universe of oil and gas properties we appraise. In seeking to avoid appraising any oil and gas property **above** its fair cash market value, Capitol Appraisal employs a market adjustment factor (MAF) to its base discount rate in order to apply property specific risk(s). These factors, which create a wide range of discount rates for the properties that Capitol appraises, are necessary to equitably evaluate disparate leases with respect to remaining reserves, price and costs. By performing two DCF income approach appraisals on each property, Capitol Appraisal provides clients with our opinion of market value, while always endeavoring to guard against appraising a mineral lease at greater than its fair cash market value.

[A **jurisdictional exception** to the Discounted Cash Flow technique, as this process is described in the Statement on Appraisal Standards #2, 2003 edition of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice, must be taken. Section 23.175(a) of the Texas Property Tax Code both specifies the directives concerning oil and gas pricing that appraisal districts in Texas must follow and also that each appraisal district must adhere to procedure and methodology contained in manuals developed by the Property Tax Division (PTD) of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. Because adherence to this Property Tax Code directive, without discretion, can result in values greater than fair cash market value, we must express caution.]

The resulting oil and gas lease value is then allocated to each owner on the lease based upon his fractional mineral ownership interest. Royalty and working interests have different impacts on their respective values, since only working interests bear the costs of lease operation. Therefore royalty mineral interest owner's values are allocated from 100% of the appraised royalty value of the lease, according to their fractional royalty interest, while the working interest owner's value(s) are allocated from 100% of the determined working interest value of the lease, according to their fractional working interest.

Review and Testing

Each year we review the estimated market value for each mineral property appraised according to its year-to-year value change and also to industry expected payouts and income indicators. We also examine income projected to be received with the previous year's income and test that income against the lease's appraised value. Market value for income producing properties is a multiple of its monthly or annual income. Our experience through the years indicates that values typically vary within in a range of 2-5 times income, provided all appropriate income factors have been appropriately identified. Periodic reassignment of properties among appraisers and review of appraisals by a more experienced appraiser also contribute to the review process.

Application of appraisal-to-sales ratios is another method for measuring performance. However, single property sales or sales of interest(s) within a property remain difficult to obtain due Texas' disclosure laws. Furthermore many market transactions are normally for multiple properties in multiple areas and include both real and personal property, tangible and intangible. We access licensed databases providing statistical data for company and property sales to compare our efforts. We also measure our performance through comparison of valid single-property market transactions, if any, that are submitted for staff review. Lastly, Capitol Appraisal's mineral appraisal values are subject to review each year in the Property Value Study conducted by the Property Tax Division of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. The Property Tax Division's review as well as comparisons to industry transactions and to single-property market value sales (when available), indicate the validity of the models, techniques and assumptions used.